In Baltimore, Robert J. Breckinridge’s quest for reform found a new voice. In January of 1855, two Baltimore pastors, Stuart Robinson (Central Presbyterian Church) and Thomas E. Peck (Broadway Street Church) launched the Presbyterial Critic and Monthly Review, a magazine in the tradition of Breckinridge’s Baltimore Literary and Religious Magazine, though with less anti-Catholic material.[98] The editors conceived their paper as a forum for discussion of church polity, accessible to all officers of the church. From the start they argued that the boards had been “hastily devised” and did not accord with a “‗strict construction‘ of the powers conferred by the Constitution on the Judicatories of the Church,” and they served notice that they would oppose “all tendencies within the church itself, to the centralization of power.”[99] While both Robinson and Thornwell emphasized the spirituality of the church, Robinson concerned himself more with the centralization of power.

After the first issue, the gloves came off, and Robinson launched his assault on the boards of the church. He had authored a review of the 1854 General Assembly in the Southern Presbyterian Review, echoing Breckinridge and Thornwell’s claim that the Boards were a residue of Congregationalism and calling for reform “either peacefully or forcibly, through the Boards, or over the Boards.”[100] Robinson argued that the “radical differences amongst us, as to the polity and measures of the church,” amounted to “two distinct Presbyterianisms.” In a telling comparison, he suggested that “It is a difference analogous in some respects, to that which divides the two political parties of the country,—the theory of ‗strict construction,‘ as it is called, against the theory of large powers to the General Government.”[101] Robinson would defend the strict constructionist position, convinced that the constitution of the church provides for “all the agencies and means necessary to carry out the purposes of the church.”[102]

Robinson’s rhetorical jabs at his colleagues provoked a war of words and wit. Virtually every issue of the Presbyterial Critic included lengthy sparring with other editors, liberally spiced with sarcasm and ridicule.[103] Robinson was constitutionally unable to keep quiet in the face of criticism. He kept up a regular exchange with other editors, exercising a caustic tongue at times.[104] While David McKinney, editor of the Presbyterian Banner, criticized certain aspects of the boards, he thought Robinson paranoid. Robinson’s insinuations and personal attacks disgusted him.[105] McKinney sought some minor reforms to improve the efficiency of the boards, but Robinson’s all-out assault disturbed him.

Nonetheless, Robinson hoped that his efforts would bear fruit in continuing the Breckinridge reformation of the church. Indeed, he suggested that the reformation had largely succeeded, and that virtually all ministers now agreed that “the form of the Church is of divine authority.”[106] He identified three positions within the church: 1) “thorough Presbyterianism” that affirmed the “Act and Testimony” of 1834, sometimes called “High Church Presbyterianism,” characterized by Thornwell and Dr. John Krebs of New York,[107] 2) the “Virginia School” of Archibald Alexander and William Swan Plumer, which joined in the reform of the church in 1837 but was not entirely committed to further reform; and 3) the “Princeton Party” led by Charles Hodge, which “driven to make election by the events of 1837 and ’38, preferred the Old School” but had firmly stood against further reform.[108] Robinson made it clear that he stood for “thorough Presbyterianism.”

In 1856 Robinson was called to Danville Theological Seminary, where he joined R. J. Breckinridge on the faculty. In 1858 he published The Church of God As An Essential Element of the Gospel, setting forth his conviction that “an ecclesiastical reformation was no less important than the reformation doctrines of justification by faith and the exclusive authority of Scripture.”[109] Robinson suggested a historical progression in the development of doctrine. Whereas the early church articulated the doctrines of the Trinity and Christology, and the Reformation first clearly stated the doctrines of salvation, he believed that the American Presbyterian Church had the opportunity to clarify the doctrine of the church:

Do not the providences of God toward the American Church, in freeing her from the civil domination which, by violence or seduction, silenced the martyr voice of her Scotch mother when she would testify for Christ’s crown and covenant, and in placing the Church here in a position (For the first time, perhaps, since the Apostles), to
actualize fully and without hindrance her true nature and functions as a spiritual commonwealth—do not all seem to indicate that the time has fully come for the final development of the visible Church as a governmental power on earth, yet a kingdom not of this world, a people not reckoned among the nations? [110]
The spirituality of the church, for Robinson, flowed from the old Scottish doctrine of the church, once the church was freed from the encumbrance of the state.”

—Table of Contents—

Volume 1, Number 1 (January 1855)
I. “Our Idea” 1-6
II. Relations of our Theological Seminaries to our System of Church Government 7-13
III. “A Theodicy; or, Vindication of the Divine Glory, as manifested in the Constitution and Government of the Moral World, by Albert Taylor Bledsoe (NY: Carlton & Philips, 1853) 13-20
IV. Hints for the Times [Presbyterianism as the best system] 21-25
V. The Posture and Life of the Presbyterian Church: Considered in her Relations to the Subject of Ministerial Education 26-32
VI. “The Great General Assembly of 1854” 33-41
VII. Our Motto: “Truth, like a torch, the more it’s shook it shines” [reprinted in Writings, volume 1, pp. 13-24] 42-48

Volume 1, Number 2 (February 1855)
I. Temporalities vs. Spiritualities 53-60
II. Relations of the Seminaries to the General Assembly 60-66
III. A Glance at the Present Position of the Eldership of the Presbyterian Church 66-72
IV. Thornwell’s Discourses on Truth 73-78
V. The Issues Stated [re: Education] 78-83
VI. Papal Organs in Congress 83-86
VII. The General Assembly of 1854 as per The Southern Presbyterian Review 86-93

Volume 1, Number 3 (March 1855)
I. The Radical Difference : In the Last Analysis of the Church Question 111-116
II. Temporalities vs. Spiritualities (Concluded.) 116-122
III. Whose Children Have a Right to Baptism?, by Thomas E. Peck 122-128
IV. The General Assembly and the German Reformed Church 128-134
V. Sabbath Rail-Way Trains—To the Presbyterian Stockholders and Directors in Railway Companies 134-140
VI. Papal Organs in Congress 140-151
Volume 1, Number 4 (April 1855)

I. The Question of Ecclesiastical Property, and Franchises—In its bearing on the True Mission of the Church 149-156
II. The Proof and the Holding Fast 156-161
III. Pastoral Letter on the Observance of the Sabbath—to the Congregations under the Care of the Presbytery of Baltimore [“read before that body on the 12th of April, 1854”]; by Thomas E. Peck, and reprinted in his collected Writings, volume 1, pp. 195-205] 161-168
IV. Church Unity and the Episcopal Memorialists 168-175
V. Papal Organs in Congress 175-184
VI. Who Should be Just and Make the Amende? — Stuart Robinson to Dr. McKinney 185-193

Volume 1, Number 5 (May 1855)

I. More Boards in the Presbyterian Church.—Some Inquiry into Fundamental Principles 197-204
II. A Diorama of the Churches 204-211
III. A Ruling Elder’s Views of Presbyterian Forms and Doctrines as Suited to the Masses 211-218
IV. The American Party. Its Cause, Progress, Objects and Result 218-222
V. The Mission of the Comforter 222-229
VI. “Spirit of American Presbyterianism”—As per the Presbyterian Quarterly Review 229-237

Volume 1, Number 6 (June 1855)

I. “The Church Question” 245-249
II. Who are the Revolutionists?—The New Crusade against the Synod of Baltimore 249-256
III. Abstractionists 257-261
IV. The Great Need of the Presbyterian Church at this Time 262-271
V. The Office of Deacon 271-277
VI. “The American Party” 277-286
VII. Suggestions Touching a Union Protestant Infirmary, Addressed to Evangelical Christians of All Denominations 286-288

Volume 1, Number 7 (July 1855)

I. A Letter to the Hon. Charles Sumner, A Senator in Congress from the State of Massachusetts: Occasioned by his Anti-Slavery Discourse in Niblo’s Theatre, by R.J. Breckinridge 293-301
II. Church Elections—Who May Vote for Pastor? 301-307
III. The Wisdom of Man vs. The Power of God 307-315
IV. The Gospel Idea of Preaching 315-320
V. Brownsoniana for April 1855 320-329
VI. The Critic and Its Censors 329-336
**Volume 1, Number 8 (August 1855)**

I. The General Assembly of 1855 341-354


III. Suggestions Touching the Presbyterian System for Spreading the Gospel 361-370

IV. State Education Radically Wrong 370-375

V. Letter to a Kentucky Lawyer 376-379

VI. Papal Philosophism.—Balmes 380-384


---

**Volume 1, Number 9 (September 1855)**

I. The General Assembly of 1855 (continued from August No.) 389-403

II. The Chamber of Imagery in the Church of Rome [by Thos. Peck, cf. Writings, I.246-257] 403-411


IV. Report of the Board of Education for 1855 417-422

V. Sacred Architecture and Spiritual Religion 423-426

VI. The Victory of Faith, by Julius Charles Hare (Lond., 1847) 427-431


---

**Volume 1, Number 10 (October 1855)**

I. The General Assembly of 1855 (continued from September No.) 437-449

II. The Presbyterian Quarterly Review on the (N.S.) General Assembly of 1855 450-457

III. The Gospel Preached to the Poor [reprinted in Writings, volume 1, pp. 25-35] 457-464

IV. Historical Facts and Documents Relating to the Origin of the Central Presbyterian Church, Baltimore 464-471

V. Statistics of Baptism in the Presbyterian Church 471-475

VI. Mission of the Presbyterian Church—Dr. Breckinridge’s Missionary Sermon 476-479


---

**Volume 1, Number 11 (November 1855)**

I. Popular Lectures and Lecturers—Necessity of Reforming Both 485-490

II. Trustees of Church Property—Their Functions and Relations to the Deacons of the Church 490-497

III. Letter of a Virginia Pastor to an Inquirer Concerning the Proper Subjects of Baptism 497-504

IV. The Late Meeting of the Synod of Baltimore 505-509

V. Formalism, Puritanism, and Rationalism—The Three Religions, as Developed from Their Germinal Principle 509-516

VI. Second Volume of the Critic—Our Plans and Purposes 517-520

VII. Liturgies, Instrumental Music and Architecture, by Thomas E. Peck 521-527

Volume 1, Number 12 (December 1855)

I. The Sweat of the Brow—The Brains—The Heart
II. General Principles Touching the Worship of God, by Thomas E. Peck
III. Prerogatives of the Presbytery in the Translation of Ministers
IV. Formalism—Puritanism and Rationalism—The Three Religions as Developed from Their Germinal Principle (Continued)
V. Letter of a Virginia Pastor to an Inquirer Concerning the Proper Subjects of Baptism (Concluded)
VI. What are the Constituent Elements of the Church of God, as Organized and Visible? —With Some Inferences
VII. The New Philoscophic Presbyterianism—Presbyterian Quarterly Review

Volume 2, Number 1 (January 1856)

I. The Financial Crisis of the Boards—The Rationale Thereof
II. The Relief of the Poor, by Thomas E. Peck
III. The Action of the Synod of Virginia on the Education Question
IV. Mr. Burt’s Discourse on National Character—Relations of the State to Religion
V. “Is American Evangelical Christianity a Failure?”
VI. Statisticks of Church Seminaries, and Education in Them for 1855-6.

Volume 2, Number 2 (March 1856)

I. Seymour on Romanism—The Virgin Mary, by Thomas E. Peck
II. Learned Lecturers or Learned Preachers?, by “A Presbyterian Farmer
III. Association of Ideas
IV. Ministerial Support—The Relation of Super-Annuated Ministers and the Families of Deceased Ministers to the Church—Societies for their Support
V. Zion, the Perfection of Beauty; or, The Truth, Order and Spirit of the Presbyterian Church Briefly Considered, by Joshua Phelps
VI. Rev. A. Cleveland Coxe’s Impressions of England—Yankee-Anglicanism
VII. Church and State—Dr. Brownson on the Catholic Chapter in the History of Maryland

Volume 2, Number 3 (May 1856)

I. The General Assembly of 1856, by Thomas E. Peck
II. An Essay on Liberty and Slavery, by Albert Taylor Bledsoe, L.L.D.
III. Calvin and Geneva; According to the Adversary Evidence of the “Judicious Hooker”
IV. Remarks before Baltimore Presbytery, on Asking a Release from the Pastoral Charge of The Central Presbyterian Church
### Volume 2, Number 4 (July 1856)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>The Westminster Review on Christian Missions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>The New Phase of Religious Journalism at the North</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.</td>
<td>The Position of the Church in Relation to Slavery—Testimony of the Synod of South Carolina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.</td>
<td>Letter to a Parishioner: The Practical Issue Between Presbytery and Prelacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.</td>
<td>The Last Annual Meeting of the American Tract Society—Developments of Voluntary-ism</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Volume 2, Numbers 5 & 6 (September & November 1856)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>Idea of the Church—As Developed from the Record of the Origin of the Christian Church, in Acts, Chap. 2-5.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>Church Music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.</td>
<td>Parliamentary Rules</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.</td>
<td>Recent Discussions and Deliverances of the Church Courts, Touching the Question of Ministerial Support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.</td>
<td>The Rationale of Preaching as Related to the Idea of the Church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.</td>
<td>The Fearless Inculcation of Scripture Teaching the Great Demand of this Country at the Present Time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII.</td>
<td>The Education of Our Ministers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII.</td>
<td>The Cartesian Philosophy—And Its Author</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX.</td>
<td>Popish Literature and Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X.</td>
<td>Paradoxes of the Gospel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI.</td>
<td>The Last Prophecy of the Old Testament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIII.</td>
<td>Valedictory Note</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>